

SEEDS Review Report



Prepared by

Arvind Sharma and Dr. J. K. Haldare

Content

Executive Summary	2
Introduction	3
Objective of the review		
Methodology	3
Limitations of the evaluation processes	4
Details of Observation Made	4
Review of the Programme Team	10
Review of educational leader Fellows	11
Monitoring System	11
Conclusion and recommendations	12
Annexure-		
Village Learning Centres	14
Manchitran	15
Map of project Area	17

Executive Summary

SEEDS' Bhavish Kalya project is designed for tribal adolescent for their empowerment through education, life-skill training, vocational training, setting-up small enterprises, facilitating small research on socio-cultural aspect of tribal etc. All the villages selected for the intervention are remote and situated in mountain's forests. Most of the village population constitute of tribal mainly 'Santhali' who have no access to education, health facilities and nutrition. They mainly depend on forest for their livelihood. Most of the adolescent works with their parents in forest and rest of them go to nearby brick-kiln or factories.

It is enriched experience of review team to assess and evaluate the SEEDS Bhavish Kalya project. The review team constituted of four members, a member from each organisation- Sandhan and FED and two members from SDTT. Detailed plan including methodology and tools for review had been prepared and shared with SEEDS prior to review. Question paper were also made and executed for adolescent to track their learning in language and mathematics.

It has been assessed during the review that the organization has very good rapport among villagers. It had set-up 45 Gyan Talma, Learning Centres, in 35 interior tribal villages and got enrolled approximately 850 adolescent girls and boys. Though, average attendance of each centre is 10-12 adolescents. All the learning centres are running in evening time for 2-3 hours to accommodate all working adolescents. 10 Residential camps had been conducted for adolescent, mostly for girls. Life-skill training and speech-lab have been conducted for them to enable them to take logical decisions and express themselves. Vocational training had been conducted for adolescent, plan for income-generation have been developed and implemented through youth group. Youth group is constituted mostly from adolescent coming to Talma and doing saving within the group. Total saving of all the groups is around Rs 31000/-. Adolescent were also engaged in a few community work e.g. making kitchen-garden, soak-pits etc.

The organisation has good achievement in terms of quantity as they are able to mobilise adolescent and their parents for the purpose and conducted so many activities with them. In terms of qualitative output, there are gaps in almost all endeavours. The learning level of the learner at the Talma is found low. The major reason has been identified for the slow pace of learning is the methodology (Manchitram- REFLECT) used by the organization. Resource centre, established for assessing and building capacity, has also not been able to track and short-out the problem. SEEDS team realized the gap and they started working to bring the quality aspects in the project.

SEEDS effort to facilitate educational fellowship, research on social, cultural, historical aspect of the tribal (traditional games, tools and implements, agricultural calendar, herbal medicines, traditional food recipes, traditional irrigation systems) is going excellent. Tribal adolescent s, few are adults, are encouraged to select research subject and have been provided training and guidance. All educational fellows are presented their findings confidently during the review process.

Introduction

SEEDS had launched the Bhavish Kalya project in May 2008 in 35 villages spread over three blocks (Seraikela, Chandil and Gamharia) of the Seraikela –Kharsawan District in Southern Jharkhand. Majority of the population, nearly 60 percent, of the area belongs to scheduled tribes. Families living below the poverty line constitute 77% of the total 2641 households in the project area. The literacy rate is very poor in the area especially among females. The adolescent population (9-20 years age) is approximately 3600 of whom 21% are illiterate. This is a major factor for the youth getting recruited into ultra outfits.

Literal meaning of Bhavish Kalya is future dawn. The project aims to improve the quality of life of adolescents and young adults through provision of appropriate learning opportunities and thereby creating a dynamic force for social change and economic development. The project focuses on the socio-economic-cultural aspects of the adolescents such as consciousness raising, gender relations, education through community empowerment techniques, formation of adolescent collectives, health awareness, and nurturing youth who are potential community leaders. The project also provides resource support and training to other organizations in Jharkhand that are interested in working with adolescents.

The main objectives of the proposed project are as follows –

- Basic education, life-related learning and vocational training for adolescent girls and boys in Seraikela-Kharsawan district
- Educational Leaders fellowship for innovations for addressing cultural and educational needs of vulnerable groups
- Regional Education Resource Centre towards resource support at project level and at regional level for civil society organizations and grass-root groups in Jharkhand

Review of the SEEDS Project

I. Objective of the review

- To access learning level of adolescent at Gyan Talma (Learning Centre) and to understand development in learning level in adolescence over the project period
- To understand teaching methodology, pedagogy, curriculum, TLM and existing material developed for Gyan Talma
- To access the capacity and empowerment process of youth group and their role in villages
- To access the role of Education Resource centre and its role in bringing quality into the project

II. Methodology

The methodology for reviewing the SEEDS project has been designed carefully to cover and understand strengths of the organization and to evaluate the processes of organization, at each level, under the project. Following activities had been done for review

i. Desk Study

Desk study had been done for all available documents with organization related to project which includes project proposal, documents related to activities performed and annual reports of last three years. Also all the documents related to capacity building including training module and reports of training had been reviewed.

ii. Field Visit

All the ongoing activities had been observed and evaluated including functioning of learning centres through physical visits of project villages. Unfortunately, there were

no residential camps activity was going on, at the time of the visit, as all the residential camps were conducted till last year.

- iii. **Personal Interviews**
Personal interviews had been conducted with all the important stakeholders of the project including teachers of the learning centre, adolescent boys and girls, supervisors, animators, villagers. Schedule had been designed for personal interviews and it had been exercised in 14 villages.
- iv. **Group Discussion**
Group discussion had been conducted with adolescent groups, learners at the centres and with staff of the organization. Group discussion with staff of the organization under the project had been conducted separately. Points of discussion were developed prior to the group discussion which was open ended and exploratory in nature.
- v. **Evaluation of learning level**
Evaluation of learning level of all the learners presented at day of the visit had been done through question papers on mathematics and language (Hindi). The question papers were so designed that all the learners could be put into their appropriate grade. Grading was defined on the basis of set of skills required in stages of learning.
- vi. **Presentation by Educational Leaders fellows**
A presentation session had been conducted with educational leaders on their respective subject who are doing research on socio-cultural aspect of tribal.
- vii. **Review of Financial system**
Financial system had been reviewed separately by SDTT team

III. Limitations of the evaluation processes

There were mainly two limitations in reviewing the project which are as below

- i. **Observation of Learning Centres**
All the learning centres are situated in remote tribal villages. The timings of the centres were between 6 pm to 9 pm. There were limitations of travel to villages in evening/night time due to dense forest and connectivity. For that reason few learning centre were opened in day time and visit had been made there. Two learning centres were visited in its original timings.
- ii. **Visit to Govt. Schools**
As the adolescent of the residential camps were mainstreamed into schools, there were plan to meet these adolescent boys and girls in their schools. The purpose was to take feedback of their teacher about their performances. But unfortunately due to a festival 'Makar Skranti' all the schools were closed.

Details of Observation Made

- I. **Learning Centre (Gyan Talma) - Forty five learning centres are being run by SEEDS in the remote tribal villages. Out of the forty five centres 14 centres were visited during the review. There is no question about relevance of learning centres in villages as all the govt. schools in project areas are for only the name sake.**
 - i. **Place of Learning Centres**
Most of the learning centres are situated in the middle of the village. It is running in school building, common spaces and in the house of the teachers of the learning

centre. Space for sitting for learners at houses of teachers is not sufficient. Asking to the teacher as how did they manage if all the learners enrolled present in the classroom. They replied that they use another part of the house for the purpose.

ii. Timing and sitting arrangements of the Learning Centre

All the centres runs for three hours, mostly in the evening for 6 pm to 9pm or 5 pm to 8 pm depend upon season and whether. Teachers of the centre shared that timing of centre were decided by consulting adolescents in the villages. They said that most of the adolescents are working and can't come in day hours. In the evening timing there is serious problem of lighting. Adolescents are even not able to read the written text at board. The area has no electricity connection. The sources of lights are small kerosene lamps (Dibari) and at a few places there is provision of solar lamps which is also insufficient for lighting. Adolescent seats on plastic sheets and carpet made of bamboo. There is also lack of provision of drinking water.

There is serious need to discuss with adolescent on the possibilities of opening of centres in day time

iii. Adolescent of the Learning centres

The adolescent coming at the centre is broadly divided into two categories:-

- Have enrolment in Govt. schools but not going to schools regularly
- Have no enrolment in Govt. school at all- This category can further subdivided in following categories-
 - Children who are working and not free in day time
 - Children who are not working and available in day time

It has been observed that most of the adolescents coming to the centres are working. Adolescent girls are working nearby brick kilns, factories and go to forest for picking woods. Most of them are involved in labour intensive job and working in inhumane condition for long hours.

All above categories of adolescents are learning at centre. Similar methodology has been used with all categories of children which is perhaps reason of gap in learning pace/standard among adolescents. In such circumstances the organization should design different processes and methodologies for each set of adolescents.

II. Learning Methodology

Manchitran method is being used for adolescent education across the centres. It had been assumed under the method that this method empower the adolescents as they would have critical analysis skills which would help them to understand their environment, their limitations and opportunities. It would help them finally to achieve new dimensions in their lives. This methodology has also been used for learning language (Hindi), Math and environment related issues.

During the visits to learning centres, opportunities had been given to teachers to demonstrate the methodology as how they use it in teaching language and mathematics, at a few centres visited. It had been observed that no teacher was able to do it properly. The processes under Manchitran method which is being used at centres has very little scope for the purpose defined under it conceptually. Resource material for Manchitran for each learning centre had been developed and sent by resource centre unit. It includes words and sentences for learning language. The team had found such teachers who did not have the concept of Manchitran as they were demonstrating same thing which they learnt at their training. On asking to the teachers about what they were teaching, some teachers replied that they had completed four Manchitran lessons; some said they have completed seven but no one said that how much skill adolescents learnt

for language and math. All the learners of the centre had been taught similar lessons although there were differences in their learning status. It has been expected that different centres would have different words emerging after Manchitran but unfortunately it was the same. No teacher was able to explain the differences and benefits of Manchitran as compared to teaching method in schools. Teachers were also clueless on the questions what would they do after completing of seven defined methods of Manchitran. The processes is also not connected with the self motivation and surrounding actions in real sense.

III. Teaching Learning materials

There were charts on Manchitran method pasted at each centre. Teacher shared that they had prepared the charts. Charts were not visible properly and were damaged. Sketches and text written on the chart were not visible. These charts could have been improved. Apart from Manchitran chart there were few other charts available on centre related to cleanliness.

Other TLM like 'Gintimala' and 'Chakari' (additions and subtraction) were available at the centres. A roller-board was also there at each centre visited. For using roller board there is need of plane supporting wall but at most of the places it was not so the board were mostly unused. The centres are running in tribal areas in very different circumstances, there is need of appropriate TLM of each centre.

IV. Adolescent of Residential Camps

During the visits of learning centre the team had met many adolescents attended the residential camp organised by the SEEDS. The adolescents were happy to share about their memories at camp. Adolescent Somchand from village Dulmi shared that he was planning to run away from the camp in the beginning but very soon he was impressed with the teachers of the camp and dropped the idea of being run-away. Somlal Hemru from the Dulmi shared that he learnt about cleanliness, manners and basic education. They got enrolment in the school but presently both are working in a factory too. Sonita, Deepali, Anita and Sapna from Mahadevpur had shared that they attended the camp and they had good memories about camp teachers. Asking them what they learnt there, they replied they learnt how to speak.

Teacher shared that before camp they were not able to read and write but after the camp they got the basic skill. It had been observed that all adolescent, who attended the camp, were reading Hindi with difficulties. Teacher further shared that these learners were fluent in reading soon after attending the camp but as they were not coming to the centre regularly, they fallen behind.

Adolescent of the centre are mostly working in brick kilns, factories and engaged in picking woods in forests. They return late in the evening which causes tiredness and little possibilities of attending the classes. In the view of the above circumstances there is serious need to rethink on the strategy to engage with these working adolescents.

V. Achievements of Maths, Hindi and LSE:

Adolescent of the centre are learning Hindi and Mathematics at the centres. Manchitran method is being applied with learners to read and write in Hindi and to perform mathematical operations. These learning centres have been working for two and half years. It has been expected from adolescent girls and boys that they could able to understand the context and could read and write Hindi. Similarly, In Mathematics, it has been expected that learners would be able to perform mathematical operations- addition, subtraction, multiplication and division. On the basis of these assumptions the organization prepares question papers for monthly tests.

Keeping in the view of learning standards, question paper were designed by the review team to assess language and mathematics skills. The question papers were so designed to track basic concepts and its clarity for language and mathematics. The question papers were executed at all the centre visited. Findings of the test have been given below in following table:-

Table 1

No.	Village	Works heet filled-up	Hindi				Math				Sub total
			A	B	C	Sub total	Works heet filled-up	A	B	C	
1	Sakladih	11	3	0	8	11	11	0	4	7	11
2	Gopinathpur	5	0	3	2	5	5	1	2	2	5
3	Dulmi	8	1	2	5	8	12	1	8	3	12
4	Jurgu	11	2	1	8	11	11	2	7	2	11
5	Barsida	8	0	0	8	8	8	1	2	5	8
6	Lapaibera	10	0	0	10	10	11	3	3	5	11
7	Mahadevpur	6	0	0	6	6	7	2	2	3	7
8	Kasida	5	0	0	5	5	5	3	1	1	5
9	Dhanobandh	13	2	1	10	13	14	2	6	6	14
10	Sonaltand	16	2	5	9	16	16	2	12	2	16
11	Dhunaburu	10	1	1	8	10	10	0	5	5	10
12	Tulgram	4	0	0	4	4	5	1	1	3	5
13	Balidih	7	2	2	3	7	5	3	1	1	5
14	Rayedra-I	11	3	5	3	11	11	6	3	2	11
15	Rayedra-II	10	2	4	4	10	11	6	3	2	11
		135	18	24	93	135	142	33	60	49	142

From the above table, it is very clear that total 142 adolescent boys and girls participated in the process. Out of these adolescent 93 are even not able to copy Hindi words form question paper. Out of total number of adolescents appeared for Hindi, only 18 adolescent got A grade. Similarly, in the mathematics out of 142 adolescents only 33 are able to do successfully addition and subtraction. But they are making mistake in multiplication and division.

Findings on adolescent learning is little discouraging. It has been observed that there is need to work on writing work in Hindi. Adolescents who are able to read paragraph finds difficulties in searching answers from the same paragraph e.g. very few adolescent were able to answer a question (when do you have tears in your eyes?)from the paragraph.

Table-2

No.	Village	Attdn.
1	Sakladih	11
2	Gopinathpur	5
3	Dulmi	12
4	Jurgu	11
5	Barsida	8
6	Lapaibera	11
7	Mahadevpur	7
8	Kashida	5
9	Dhanobandh	14
10	Sonaltand	16
11	Dhunaburu	10
12	Tulgram	5
13	Balidih	5
14	Rayedra-I	11
15	Rayedra-II	11
		142

Attendance of Adolescents at
Gyan Talma (on the day of the visit)

VI. Enrolment at the Learning centre and Attendance of Adolescents

It has been observed at all the centres visited that there are low attendances of adolescent boys and girls. Teachers of the learning centre also shared that nearly 8-10 adolescents comes at the centre regularly. On the day of the visit attendance of adolescents is compiled in the table.

It is clear from the table that there is low attendance at each centre. Asking the teacher about low attendances they responded that as adolescents of the centre are working they are not able to come regularly. In this context there is need to develop new strategies to ensure regularities of adolescent at the centre. The attendance may increase if the adolescents and their parents visualise the achievements through the learning centres.

VII. Teachers of the Learning Centres

All the teachers of the learning centre are educated youths of same villages. Most of them studied between class 8th-10th. Most of them are also continuing their education besides. Sunita Manjhi of Kasida village is studying in class 10th. She go to her school at Kharsawan village, thirteen kilometre away from her village, everyday by Bicycles.

Most of the teachers falls in age group of 18-21 years, similar to learner's age group, and belongs to same village. It could be considered as strength of the programme. The teachers of the centre are well aware of their learners at the centre including their learning status and their culture. Despite of all these strengths there are few weaknesses of the teachers too. Few of them are weak in reading and writing. They are not able to divide 315 by 3 correctly. There are lack of conceptual clarity on many issues.

The teachers shared that they got initial seven days training before starting the centres. They learned how to use Manchitran method with learners. Teachers also attended two-three more trainings till date but they are not able to achieve desire level of learning slandered of the adolescent boys and girls. A monthly meeting is also being conducted with teachers. The meeting starts at 10.30 and ends-up in afternoon as teachers have to go long way for their villages. The agenda of the meeting includes collecting information from all the centres and planning for next month. It has been observed that all centres has almost similar plan of action for next month. The planning of each centre should be done in the context of learning level of adolescents of each centre and challenges. This is the reason for lack of designing processes for each adolescents of the centre.

VIII. Support System

The organisation placed supervisor and two animators for each cluster of villages to meet the need of regular support to the learning centres. Supervisors and animators are responsible for providing continuous support to the centres. Animators visits to each centre minimum four times in a month and supervisor visit once in a month to the centre in their cluster for review and support. During the visit review team made detailed discussion with supervisors and animators. All the teachers of the learning centre shared that supervisor and animators visits as per their schedule.

Teacher shared that supervisor and animator help them in solving problem but could not share specific incidences. All learning centres runs in remote tribal villages in the evening time. Supervisor and animators shared that they find difficult to visit in centre's

functioning hours. A few animators who live nearby the centre visit the centre in evening time. During discussion with animators it had been assessed that most of them had lack of clarity about vision of the learning centre. They are also not taking-up issues at each centre, in their cluster, by their own understanding. They are not ensuring the proper usage of resources available at the centres like roller board. Solar lamp at Kashida village is non-operational, since two-three months, but no initiative have been taken. Supervisor and animators are mostly prioritise writing minutes of meeting rather maintaining quality of the learning centres.

IX. Adolescent's group

SEEDS formed adolescent groups of boys and girls in each village. Members of the group shared that animators meets them regularly and motivate them for group formation and strengthening. Most of the groups are doing savings in the group. Gurwari from Dhanobandh shared that her 12 members group contribute five rupees per month toward saving. The contribution amount varies group to group from Rs. 5 to Rs. 20. All members of the group have well maintained pass-book of their savings. She further shared that this money can be further used for emergency need for members and can be used for some small businesses.

It has been assessed by review team that there were lack of clarity among youth group and the animators about purpose of forming the groups. Adolescent groups generally discuss issues related to saving. These discussions were documented in minutes register.

X. Activities of Adolescent Group

Adolescent are involved in small business like poultry, incense stick making, vegetable production. These are not done by more than 6-7 groups. The small business plan was done like an activity, once done it is over. There is no long term strategy or follow up have been seen anywhere. It had found that raw material purchase for incense making is going waste; only one production had been done using small part of raw materials.

XI. Youth Resource Centre

Youth resource centres have been visited during the review. Resource centre at Mahadpura village is running in a hut at outskirts of the village. A youth, Belwa Hembarm, from the village is running the centre. Tribal musical instruments are also placed in YRC. Adolescent from the village were playing football outside. The centre has resources like football, books, globe, Thermometer etc. Asking Belwa where is India in the globe she could not reply. Similarly in another village asking YRC in-charge how to map temperature, she could not reply.

Youth taking care of YRCs are full of enthusiasm but have little support for enhancing required skills. Though, animators and supervisor come to meet them but they are also not getting the real purpose of youth resource centre. There is need to bring its linkage with learning centre such that both the centres can use resources of each other effectively.

XII. Resource Centre

SEEDS had established a resource centre under the project to support the centres in villages as well as to provide resources and support to NGOs working on similar issues in the state of Jharkhand. Resource centre has been visited and activities done by the centre is evaluated during review process. Discussion has also made with members of resource centre. On the basis of discussion, work of resource centre can be broadly divided in three categories-

1. Educational resource material
2. Training Module

3. Training

1. Educational resource material:

Resource centre is designing resource material which is required to meet the need of the intervention. Resource centre monitor the learning centre and participate in the monthly meeting of the teachers. Based on discussion and feedback in the meeting, resource centre prepare the materials. The available materials at resource centre are alphabets, words, sentences in Hindi language and counting, method for simple addition and subtraction. Apart from it, there were charts on personal hygiene and cleanliness, model on human body and ideal village, games and puzzles available at the centre.

These educational resource materials were not seen at learning centres during the visit. It has been felt by review team that these material are useful for learning centre but lack of availability and capacity building of teachers on these material reduces the effectiveness of the these materials.

Educational resource material available at the centre is useful for primary level of learning. It is not meant for higher level of learning. There is need to develop such materials e.g. in mathematics there is need to develop material on multiplication, division, measurement etc.

2. Training Module

Modules have been developed by Resource centre for each training. Training modules are well designed and can be used by anyone for conducting trainings. There is clarity among sessions, objective of the session, issues to be taken in each session in the modules.

Life skill module can be done better if the module take examples referring local context, name etc. Also, all modules should also be available in Hindi.

3. Training

Training is one of the main responsibilities of the resource centre; they have to work towards capacity building of all staffs under the project according to their job responsibilities. Resource centre had conducted training with teachers, animators, supervisors, and adolescent boys and girls. These trainings include Manchitran, Life skill, advocacy and vocational training. These all issues require special attention and follow up trainings, for example training of teachers of learning centre needs continuous follow-up training. One day monthly meeting with teacher should be made two day meeting and it should also be used for capacity building of teachers. Life skill training also needs regular follow up trainings. All training conducted by resource centre had been documented.

Review of the Programme Team

A day had been planned to review entire team under the project in order to understand their clarity about vision of the project, their responsibilities, coordination among staffs and expectations from their immediate supervisors as well as other senior staffs. In the process a few group works has been conducted on these aspect and it had been tried that gap in these areas could be identified and discussed among all staffs.

During the discussion it had been assessed that vision was clear among senior members of the team like director, coordinators and member of resource centre. Junior members were aware of part of information, related to their job. They do not know why Manchitran method had been selected, what was its relation with education of adolescent.

All staffs of the organization are dedicated and working for missions, especially coordinators. They have their define job responsibilities but it requires rethinking in terms of ensuring quality in the project.

A group work on strength and weaknesses/challenges had also been conducted. It has been concluded from the group work that there is need to work on both the aspects. It seems that SEEDS had not appraised the project output critically. There are many gaps which could have been shorted out very easily like

- The learning centres are functioning in evening time. No one is available to monitor and support to teachers for improving quality at this time period. The supervisors and coordinators should stay there overnight. Possibilities for changes of timings of the centre can also be explored.
- There is lack of provision of lighting at most of the centres. There should be provision for sufficient lighting, small kerosene lamp (Dibari) can't useful for the purpose. Where there are solar lamps, bulb can be replaced by CFL.
- Seating arrangements at the centres should be proper
- Four hours monthly meeting with teachers of 45 centres, animators and supervisors is just not enough, sufficient time for the meeting should be planned

Strength and weakness of the organization

Strength	Weaknesses
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All the centres selected under the project are critical and situated in remote tribal village. All the field staffs are energetic and follow the instruction given • The organization has leadership of Ms. Subhra Diwedi. She is experienced have broader vision and very polite in her behaviour • Coordinators are dedicated to their field work. Mr. Jagbandhu is among of them who is experienced and have acceptability among adolescent • Documentation and report writing is strong area of the organization 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is lack of coordination between head office and ERC with field • External person is not involved who can give critical view on project aspects • There is lack of resource persons who can provide academic support to the teachers of the centre • There is no exposure visits to organization doing similar work

Review of educational leader Fellows

Review of educational leader fellows was quite encouraging. A presentation session had been conducted with educational leaders on their respective subject. They are doing research on socio-cultural aspect of tribal. The fellows were provided basic orientation on how to conduct research and its steps. At the time of presentation all fellows were confident and sharing their findings till date. It has assessed by the review team that work of SEEDS with educational fellows going fine. There is need of networking among all educational leaders to pull all the tribal researcher at equal platform.

Monitoring System

There is lack of participatory impact monitoring (PIM) system where community and teachers can participate in such a way that their learning and expectation could critically reflect in order to enhance the quality of intervention.

Review and planning meetings held on different time intervals. But in all these meetings, focus has been made on planning instead of learning from past and then planning. ERC developed many formats for monitoring but it is complicated and has limited scope. Seeking

quantitative data is only one component of monitoring; it should not be made only base for measuring project outcomes.

Conclusion and recommendations:

I. Pedagogy and methodology of teaching Learning

The methodology used for providing education to adolescence is based on the principle of Manchitran, which is derived from Paulo Freire. The assumption has been taken that if the tribal adolescent understands their environment and if methodology use local resources and knowledge, the learning of adolescent would be speedy with enhanced knowledge of local resources. But the application of this method is not as it should have been there ideally. There is very little space for innovations under the adapted method. There is also lack of clarity about action after completion of all nine methods of Manchitran. It has been felt that this method should only be used in initial months, say 6 to 9 months, after the period there is need to develop alternative methods for learning, according to the status of adolescents. If the organization does not depend on the method and open for other alternative method, it would be very efficient in the prevailing conditions. Under the method work can be done on improving skills of critical thinking and decision making through life-skill training and follow-ups. The organization should work towards mainstreaming of children in initial phase of interventions.

II. Individual Tracking System and Follow-up

There is mechanism in place for individual tracking and follow-up under the project but seems theoretically sound only. In the current mechanism, there are processes of documenting many aspect of individual tracking but it is not able to capture the real situation. A few aspects which had been tracked but did not take up for further improvement. There is need to follow FED model for micro-planning, follow-up residential camps, village level non residential trainings.

There is also need to ensure follow up actions under the same person who is responsible for main activity. Reports and minutes of monthly meeting were documented very systematically but its impact on quality of the project is very less hence, there is need to re-strategise the mechanism.

III. Monitoring in the remote Areas

Monitoring mechanism needs to develop considering geographical conditions. In the existing mechanism person specific responsibilities has been given for defined areas. But it has not been ensured that these persons stay at centres overnight or couple of days and observe each process by their own. There is also need to build capacities of these persons to understand the required processes.

IV. Capacity of Local teachers and their Training

There should be minimum qualification for selecting the teachers, which should be class XIIth. Looking into difficult situation existing qualification of teachers can be considered but it is also true that they are not able to perform their expected roles. Orientation and initial training has been conducted but there is requirement of series of follow-up trainings. There is also need of continuous support to teachers on academic and technical related learning.

Four hours monthly meeting with teachers of 45 centres, animators and supervisors is just not enough, sufficient time for the meeting should be planned. There is also need to invite resource persons and people from community in review planning meeting

V. Potential of resource support role

Education resource centre in the project cannot be recognised for strong role. There is need of exposure visits of the members of ERS to other relevant NGOs like FED.

Academic knowledge of the ERS alone is not sufficient without grass root experience and information. Education material can be developed by using local resources and information collected by educational leaders. TLM made by ERS is appreciable but there is need to plan TLM using local words, context, names, events, culture etc.

ERC members should go for regular field visits and should stay at different clusters. ERC and field office should be placed at one place for better harmony and functioning

VI. Other Main Points

- There is need to develop new strategies to ensure regularities of adolescent at the centre. The attendance may increase if the adolescents and their parents visualise the achievements through the learning centres. There is need to discuss and mobilise parents of adolescent so that adolescent should come to the centre regularly. Also number of adolescent will be increased to the centre. The processes should be initiated to increased participation of Talma Sanchalan Samiti.
- Centre should be situated at common spacious places with proper sitting and lighting arrangements
- Educational resource material should available at all the centre. There is also need of developing materials for advance learning e.g. for mathematics there is need to develop material on multiplication, division, measurement etc.
- Moving library should be made functional
- There should be networking among all educational leaders
- There is need to work on monthly magazine Pradeepak on reader friendly font, context

Annexure-I

Village Learning Centres

1. Sakladih I	16. Bandhihipa	31. Balidih
2. Jurgu	17. Barsida I	32. Tulgram
3. Sonaltand I	18. Barsida II	33. Reyarda III
4. Dulmi	19. Dhunaburu	34. Palubera II
5. Janakipur	20. Bhadrodi	35. Bhalukpahari II
6. Reyarda I	21. Gidibera I	36. Gopinathpur II
7. Reyarda II	22. Gidibera II	37. Lapaibera II
8. Kasida	23. Gopinathpur I	38. Raipur
9. Palubera I	24. Madhupur	39. Sakladih II
10. Nayadih	25. Mohuldih	40. Sonaltand II
11. Dhanobandh	26. Panarol	41. Ratanpur
12. Bhalukpahari I	27. Raghunathpur	42. Rangamatia
13. Lapaibera I	28. Charakpathar	43. Tipikpani
14. Mundatand	29. Sindri	44. Reyarda IV
15. Mahadevpur	30. Palgam	45. Tirildih

Manchitran

The *Manchitran* technique has its foundation in the REFLECT concept, where there are no text books. Maps, graphs, pictures, calendars, matrices representing local realities form the basis of the lessons on language, as well as maths and environment. These self-developed lessons help individuals to understand their situation, systematize the existing knowledge of individuals and motivate them to analyse the local issues and find solutions to their own problems.

Based on the knowledge of the area, SEEDS has developed nine *Manchitrans* which enable the adolescents to learn language and maths while they learn about the issues related to their daily life and are important for the enhancement of their lives. These are as under:

1. Apna Ghar (My house)
2. Samajik (Society)
3. Din-Charya (Daily routine)
4. Swasthya (Health)
5. Aai-Vyai (Income-Expenditure)
6. Krishi (Agriculture)
7. Shiksha (Education)
8. Pashu-Palan (Animal Husbandry)
9. Hamare Sansadhan (Natural Resources)

How a Manchitran is taught?

- 1 The *Machet* introduces the subject in the form of a discussion. This encourages learners' participation and enhances vocabulary building, fluency in speaking and the thinking process.
- 2 Words that can be shown pictorially are drawn on the board by either the teacher or the learner and the word is written down next to it.
- 3 The teacher then explains the *manchitran* to the class and shows the final outcome pictorially. The class then carries out the activity either on the floor or on chart paper. Each *Manchitran* has a definite format for its preparation.
- 4 The learners discuss the issue amongst themselves before preparing the *Manchitran* and then make a presentation in front of the whole class. A discussion with the teacher helps in analysing the current situation and identifying areas that need improvement and helps the learners come out with solutions to their problems.
- 5 They then identify related words and out of those they prioritize three words. Then the *Machet* breaks them up into *akshars* and *matras*. These are then used to form new words starting with two letter words without *matras* and progress thereon.
- 6 These words are all written down and then the teacher and learners jointly prepare a lesson using these very words. These lessons comprise 8-12 short simple sentences. Apart from reading these sentences, meanings of all unknown words are explained and then the learners are asked to make sentences of their own from words selected by the teacher.
- 7 While *Manchitrans* form the base for learning a language, maths is also built into it. E.g the teachers ask questions related to number and quantity, such as in the *Apna Ghar Manchitran* they ask, "how many people are there in your house? Of these how many are male? Therefore, how many females are there?" Similarly, questions are asked about animals and as understanding progresses questions relate to the quantity of produce from one animal to several animals.
- 8 Information related to environment is also discussed during the teaching of the *Manchitran*. For example, in *Samajik Manchitran* when sources of water are discussed, the *Machet* explains about the sources of water in the village, the importance of keeping

water sources clean and about the hydrological cycle and about the importance of water conservation.

- 9 While discussing issues related to the village, if they come across a problem, such as out of 3 hand-pumps in the village, 2 need repairing. Then the *Machet* takes them through a discussion where they come up with a **possible action**. In this case, it would be to get the two defunct hand-pumps working once again and how they would go about it – such as write an application to the Block Development Officer and chase the concerned authorities till the work is accomplished.

The discussion about keeping the water sources clean leads to another **possible action** i.e. making of soakage pits near hand pumps to avoid water logging. At home the learners ensure that waste water drains out to their kitchen garden or into the field. This practice would be imbibed by the neighbourhood and finally by the whole village.

Annexure-III

Area visited are highlighted in yellow

